



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

DRAFT MINUTES

Monday, June 22, 2020

Electronic

PRESENT: Janice Shimokubo, Chair
Emily Hinchman, Vice Chair
James Eaneman
Marty Day
Conay Huizar
Hannellie Mendoza
Stuart Rhoden

STAFF: Sharon Cini
Brent Stockwell
Bill Hylen
Kelly Corsette
Megan Lynn
Alan Rodbell, Police Chief

GUESTS: Virginia Korte, City Councilmember

Call to Order/Roll Call

Chair Shimokubo called the meeting to order at 5:00 p.m.

Public Comment

There were no members of the public who wished to speak.

1. Approval of minutes from the March 9, 2020 meeting

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED TO APPROVE THE MARCH 9, 2020 HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES. VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, HUIZAR, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

2. Chairperson's opening remarks

Commissioners observed a moment of silence in honor of George Floyd.

Chair Shimokubo mentioned that amidst the challenges and hardships people are enduring, one positive is that the Supreme Court ruled in favor of the LGBTQ community and DACA.

3. Presentation, discussion and recommendations regarding the Commission's stance on messages to the community considering national discourse on race

Chair Shimokubo said that following the recent protests and community dialogue, individual Commissioners expressed the strong opinion that it is important for the Commission to issue a statement of solidarity. Commissioners were asked to provide ideas that will address the national discourse on race.

Vice-Chair Hinchman said that it is important for the Commission to work with community leaders and diversity partners to stand in solidarity, encouraging respect, kindness, civility and empathy for all humankind. Community partners, including SUSD Governing Board, SUSD Parent Council, Be Kind People Project, and Experience Scottsdale have all signed on to work with the Commission in this endeavor.

Extensive discussion ensued regarding standardizing messaging, reevaluating the strategic plan, non-discrimination ordinance, ERA amendment, policy changes, and advocacy. Suggestions included writing a letter of intent to City Council, communicating with individual City Council members, appointing a citizens committee, holding a town hall, employee cultural sensitivity training, and reintroducing the anti-discrimination clause. Commissioners felt that immediate action is needed and agreed that a letter outlining HRC's intentions should be sent to City Council as soon as possible.

COMMISSIONER RHODEN MOVED TO SCHEDULE A SERIES OF FOUR TOWN HALLS THE WEEK OF JULY 6, 2020 AND OFFERING OPPORTUNITY FOR CITIZENS TO ALSO SUBMIT WRITTEN COMMENTS. THE MOTION DIED FOR LACK OF A SECOND.

Bill Hylen cautioned Commissioners to tailor any recommendations to the language outlined in the agenda item.

Brent Stockwell said that with respect to a virtual town hall, the City has access to "Call in Studio," which works in conjunction with Zoom to allow for up to 250 citizens to call in. He cautioned about planning a public input session on short notice, especially during summer.

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED THAT THE HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION RESOLVES THAT A STATEMENT BE PREPARED IN CONJUNCTION WITH AGENDA ITEM 3, AND FORWARDED TO CITY COUNCIL NO LATER THAN JULY 1, 2020, AND THAT THE HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION RESOLVES OVER THE NEXT TWO WEEKS TO WORK ON THE STRUCTURE, TIMING, AND SCHEDULE OF A SERIES OF TOWN HALL MEETINGS. THE MOTION DIED FOR LACK OF A SECOND.

Mr. Stockwell said that the Commission has the ability to direct the Chair and Vice Chair to forward a recommendation to City Council. The final letter could be shared with Commissioners, noting that if there are no objections the letter will be forwarded to Council. If there were any objections, discussion of the letter's content would have to be agendized for a future meeting.

VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN MOVED TO APPROVE THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR SENDING A STATEMENT TO CITY COUNCIL REGARDING THE HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION'S STANCE ON MESSAGES TO THE COMMUNITY CONCERNING NATIONAL DISCOURSE ON RACE, ALONG WITH THE COMMISSION'S PLANS TO MOVE FORWARD IN THE NEXT THREE WEEKS WITH A SERIES OF TOWN HALLS REGARDING HOW THE COMMUNITY IS VIEWING THE NATIONAL DISCOURSE ON RACE. THE MOTION DIED FOR LACK OF A SECOND.

Mr. Stockwell noted that the motion should contain the specific points that will be stated in the letter to Council.

COMMISSIONER MENDOZA MOVED TO APPROVE THE COMMISSION AUTHORIZING THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY MANAGER THAT A SERIES OF REMOTE TOWN HALLS BE SCHEDULED AS SOON AS PRACTICAL, THAT THEY BE PUBLICLY NOTICED AS HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION MEETINGS SO ALL MEMBERS CAN PARTICIPATE, AND THE CITY COUNCIL MEMBERS BE INVITED TO ATTEND, AND TO SEND A MESSAGE TO THE COMMUNITY REGARDING THE NATIONAL DISCOURSE ON RACE. COMMISSIONER RHODEN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SIX (6) TO ONE (1) BY ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS HUIZAR, DAY, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE; COMMISSIONER EANEMAN DISSENTED.

CHAIR SHIMOKUBO MOVED TO APPROVE THE COMMISSION AUTHORIZING THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR TO FORWARD A LETTER TO CITY COUNCIL, LETTING THEM KNOW OF A SERIES OF TOWN HALL MEETINGS ON RACE, AND THAT THE COMMISSION WILL BE WORKING ON POLICE RECOMMENDATIONS, TO BE PRESENTED SHORTLY, RELATED TO THE NATIONAL DISCOURSE ON RACE. VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN SECONDED THE MOTION. CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, HUIZAR, DAY, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

4. Presentation, discussion and recommendations regarding race relations task force idea

Chair Shimokubo said that she was prompted to invite Councilmember Korte to present at an HRC meeting after reading an article published in the Scottsdale Independent on June 3, 2020,

focusing on Councilmember Korte and mentioning her idea for creating a race relations task force.

Councilmember Korte clarified that the idea for creation of a race relations task force is her personal idea and in no way reflects any type of direction from City Council. She thanked the Human Relations Commission for their passion and commitment to promoting equality and justice.

She said that during a recent mayoral candidate forum a question was asked of whether or not there is systemic discrimination in the City of Scottsdale police department. She answered yes, because she believes that systemic racism (unintentional bias) is a part of the human experience that has been recorded since the beginning of time. She opined that now is a good time to begin having the tough conversations in our community and across the country.

Councilmember Korte challenged the Human Relations Commission to think bigger than the conversations that have been had. She anticipated that if the non-discrimination ordinance is brought back to council at this time, with the current council in place, it will have the same opposing result. She suggested that a bigger conversation about the unintentional bias that exists within all segments of government can be had by forming a special task force.

Commissioners were given an opportunity to ask questions. Councilmember Korte clarified that she is not working to personally form a task force, in part because it is an election year. She is hopeful that a group such as the Human Relations Commission will take the lead in moving forward with the idea. She stressed that an idea of this magnitude would need to be condoned by City Council.

Vice-Chair Hinchman noted that the formation of a task force could be included in discussions about the HRC's new strategic plan. A task force is a long-term goal that could be undertaken over the next couple of years.

Commissioner Rhoden suggested that the idea of a race relations task force be included in discussions during the upcoming town hall discussions.

5. Presentation, discussion and recommendations on 2020 Human Relations Commission strategic initiatives

- Golden Rule Day Celebration- rescheduled for Saturday, April 10, 2021

Vice-Chair Hinchman said that the Golden Rule Day Celebration reschedule date was chosen because it is in the same time frame as it was for 2020. The event will be as it was planned for this year including the same messaging and keynote speaker. Materials such as banners, marketing materials, and t-shirts will be saved for use next year. A contingency plan for a virtual event is being put in place so the event can move forward in the event that it cannot be held in a physical setting.

- Dinner & Dialogue

Commissioner Rhoden said that Scottsdale SUSD Parent Council is holding a virtual version of the Dinner and Dialogue on July 7, 2020. They are planning to have eight to ten speakers and invite other people from the community to observe.

- Scottsdale For All social media plan of action and updates

Commissioner Huizar said she has been in discussions about social media plans with Ms. Cini and staff in the communications department. Their goal is to create a proactive online space for relevant and up-to-date diversity material and current events. Diversity partners will be introduced to the public in hopes of engaging people in differing platforms and with the goal of growing the social media following from approximately 800 to 1000 followers.

- Citizen engagement and education

Ms. Cini presented the Citizen Engagement and Education Project that the Office of Diversity is currently moving forward with in hopes that the HRC would be interested in considering the project as a strategic initiative.

In response to increased public requests for information on topics such as unconscious bias and implicit bias and an increased interest in engaging in dialogue, the Office of Diversity is working to strengthen educational resource information available to the public and start conversations. Objectives include helping to meet needs or requests for information and highlighting areas such as anti-racism and antisemitism through the Office of Diversity webpage, social media, and collaborative resources. Commissioners agreed that at this time it is best to evaluate the strategic plan before committing to another strategic initiative.

6. Discussion and updates regarding recent diversity and inclusion related activities and incidents impacting the city of Scottsdale

- “Free Trip to Egypt” film showing – TBD (possibly December 2020) Civic Center Library lower auditorium
- Civic Center Library – “Coffee and Conversation” December 2020
- Phoenix Pride Parade – rescheduled to November 2020

Ms. Cini said that it is hoped that the “Free Trip to Egypt” and “Coffee and Conversation” can be rescheduled for some time in December of 2020. Phoenix Pride Parade has been rescheduled to November 2020.

- Other municipality efforts – City of Chandler Community Diversity Advisory group model
- Conversations with the community – How can we effectively support each other’s efforts to advocate against discrimination? What is the best way to collaborate in the midst of continuous societal change?

Ms. Cini said that she has recently met with representatives from Chandler, Tempe, Mesa, and Gilbert to talk about how they can effectively support each other in efforts to advocate against

discrimination and how to collaborate on how to address recent societal happenings. The group is also working on plans for holding a virtual Regional Unity Festival and Walk. Each city/town reported on how they are engaging with citizens and each shared specific ideas for consideration.

Town of Gilbert reported that they have started holding "listening sessions" which are an opportunity for citizens to sign up for a 25-minute time slot where they can answer a question posted for them and record what their story is. The recording is made available for the public to listen to at a later time. The hope is that the project will help people develop empathy.

The City of Chandler has implemented a Diversity Advisory Council comprised of several members of the public and the Chandler Human Relations Commission, designed to work with the Chandler Diversity Office on their endeavors.

City of Scottsdale supported Juneteenth for the first time, posting pictures and participating on Facebook live.

City of Tempe is working on an initiative called "The Right to Breathe," which addresses underlying issues that lead to misunderstanding mistreatment and ultimately to systemic racism or systemic oppression. They are interested in doing a failure analysis to identify gaps so that the same mistakes are not repeated.

The group is hoping to create baseline data using surveys and questions and work collaboratively to come up with solutions.

- Brief update on city budget and the Office of Diversity and Inclusion/HRC endeavors

Ms. Cini said that the HRC budget has not been affected by the recent economic downturn. Funds for Commission initiatives were earmarked and are still available. The involvement of some community partner in events will be affected.

7. Identification of Future Agenda Items

The next Human Relations Commission meeting is scheduled to be held virtually on Monday, July 13, 2020.

Adjournment

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. COMMISSIONER HINCHMAN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR HINCHMAN, COMMISSIONERS EANEMAN, DAY, HUIZAR, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE. THERE WERE NO DISSENTING VOTES.

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 7:39 p.m.

Recorded and Transcribed by eScribers, LLC.